

Summary of written statement of Hans von Storch, 19. July 2006

1. Scientific aspects:

- The regression-type methods of the so-called “hockey-stick” studies of Mann, Bradley and Hughes (MBH) suffer from a number of problems, which should have been addressed before the “hockey-stick” was elevated to an authoritative description of the temperature history of the past 10000-2000 years.
- The claim by the IPCC TAR that there is reliable evidence that climate is beginning to change due to human action was based on a number of different lines of argument, which are insensitive to the validity of the MBH studies.

The present debate about the validity of the hockey-stick is of marginal relevance for the detection of present anthropogenic climate change. The major problems are not of statistical nature but are related to the social practice of climate change science.

2. Aspects of quality-control in the process of climate science

- Parts of climate change science, in particular paleo-climatic reconstructions have suffered from gate keeping and incestuous usage of reviewers.
- Editors and science managers have failed to ensure reproducibility of key results.
- Nature and Science have a bias towards “interesting results”.
- In the IPCC process experts assess their own work.

Climate change science has suffered from the limiting action of gate keepers and a public preference of “interesting results”. Climate change science should provide stakeholders with a broad range of options and not narrow this range to a reduced number of options preferred by certain worldviews.

3. Climate change science in the cultural context.

- The concept of anthropogenic climate change is not new in western culture.
- Climate change science is post-normal, i.e., it goes along with high uncertainties and high relevance. Thus, the boundaries between value-driven agendas and curiosity-driven science get blurred.

There is considerable influence of extra-scientific agendas on the scientific process of climate change studies. The process of climate change studies needs to be analysed and accompanied by social and policy scientists.